

Ward 22, St. Paul's

City Hall, 100 Queen Street West
2nd Floor, Suite A17
Toronto, Ontario M5H 2N2

Tel: 416-392-7906
Fax: 416-392-0124
councillor_matlow@toronto.ca
www.joshmatlow.ca



October 7, 2013

Dear Mr. Byford,

Thank you for your letter dated October 4, 2013 in response to my letter dated September 30, 2013 requesting additional information for the upcoming City Council meeting where future options for rapid transit in Scarborough will be debated. I appreciate the time you and your staff have taken to respond to my concerns with the McCowan Corridor subway extension of the Bloor-Danforth line and your overall dedication to improving public transit for Torontonians.

I welcome the information provided in your response on cost issues including the SRT decommission, responsibility for cost escalations and the process for allocating funding for engineering/design work associated with the new Environmental Assessment that would be necessary for the proposed McCowan Corridor subway extension. Your letter was also useful in highlighting a number of determined costs including \$30-40 million per year in capital maintenance and unknown costs such as the cancelled Bombardier contract that are not including in the \$3.56 Billion estimate contained in the Report from the City Manager on Scarborough Rapid Transit Options.

As noted in your letter, detailed planning work has not been undertaken for the McCowan Corridor extension. I was provided a description of the process used in past transit forecasting analysis and specific data from the 2006 Scarborough RT Strategic Plan, but little in the way of specific data, models and methodology used for ridership projections for the McCowan Corridor extension as requested in my letter. The density and trip origin numbers provided contemplated the route alignment of the approved LRT contained in the signed Master agreement between the TTC, City and Metrolinx. If the TTC has generated similar studies for the McCowan Corridor extension used to generate its ridership forecasts for the proposed subway I would request that it is provided to Council as an appendix to *CC. 39.5: Scarborough Rapid Transit Options: Reporting on Council Terms and Conditions in the Council meeting agenda*.

Of particular concern is your revelation that the TTC has not determined overall trip time from point of origin, including time of travel for walking and bus, for the LRT and the

proposed McCowan extension given its importance to transit riders and their representatives on Council. As the subway option provides decreased geographic coverage and fewer stops it is likely that many Scarborough residents would confront a longer overall commute with this option than with the LRT. Having this information quantified would be helpful for Councillors and residents.

I understand that it is standard practice to perform detailed planning work only after approval for a project is given. However, this is not a standard transit planning exercise. If Council gives Staff permission to move forward studying the subway extension, the only alternative - the fully-funded, shovel-ready Scarborough LRT - is dead. And in four years, if the EA confirms that the Relief Subway is, in fact, a prerequisite for the McCowan Corridor extension or it is determined that it is indeed more of a regional route that Toronto taxpayers should not be funding alone, or the technical studies find it is exorbitantly expensive due to geological features, what do we do? We'll have spent several years studying it and hundreds of millions of dollars keeping the current RT standing with nothing to show for it. Given the risks associated with the decision before Council, the TTC's rationale underpinning the McCowan Corridor extension is inadequate.

I appreciate the quick response you provided to my letter and your candour in answering my questions. I look forward to discussing this issue with you further at City Council on October 8, 2013.

Sincerely,

Josh Matlow
Toronto City Councillor
Ward 22 – St. Paul's
www.joshmatlow.ca

cc: Joseph Pennachetti, City Manager, City of Toronto
Jennifer Keesmaat, Chief Planner & Executive Director, City Planning, City of Toronto
Bruce McCuaig, President & CEO, Metrolinx